

**MINUTES OF THE  
LOUISIANA ENGINEERS SELECTION BOARD  
November 27, 2018**

A meeting of the Louisiana Engineers Selection Board (LESB) was held in the Claiborne Building, 1201 North Third Street, Room 1-155, Baton Rouge, Louisiana on Tuesday, November 27, 2018.

The meeting was called to order at 11:30 a.m. by Mr. Ali Mustapha, Chairman. Those members present were: Mr. Mark Moses, Mr. Ali Mustapha, Mr. Jim Ferguson, Mr. Bren Kramer and Mr. Lloyd Hoover. There were no members absent. Also present as Legal Counsel was Ms. Candice Rodgers Hillman, Attorney General’s Office.

The first item of business was the approval of the August 8, 2018 minutes. Mr. Ferguson made a motion to adopt the minutes; it was seconded by Mr. Hoover. With no opposition, the motion was adopted.

The next item of business was to ask for any new business. Mr. Moses presented a brief overview of the need for standardizing/updating the selection board rules and regulations, along with the application form. FP&C personnel have been working on this project. Included in each board member’s packet was a red lined copy of the proposed changes for Chapter 3 – Engineers Selection Board. The board was asked to review this information and be prepared to present and vote on any additions/edits at the next meeting. Additionally, Daina Kroll, Board Secretary, will email final redline versions for each Selection Board to board members.

The next item of business was to ask for any public comments. There was none.

The next item of business was the selection of designers.

**ITEM #1: Medical School B-Building HVAC Replacement, LSU Health Sciences Center, Shreveport, Louisiana; Project No. 19-604S-18-01, Part F.19002225;** Mr. Danny Mahaffey gave a brief scope of the project; votes were recorded as follows:

| Project # 1 Firm                                | Nomination Ballot |          |          |        |        |      |
|---|-------------------|----------|----------|--------|--------|------|
|   | Moses             | Mustapha | Ferguson | Hoover | Kramer | User |
| A – John J. Guth Associates, Inc.               | 3                 | 1        | 2        | 1      | 3      | 3    |
| E – Edmonds Engineering Services                | 1                 |          | 3        |        |        | 2    |
| D – Aillet, Fenner, Jolly & McClelland, Inc.    | 2                 | 2        | 1        |        | 2      | 1    |
| G – Purtle & Associates, LC                     |                   | 3        |          | 3      | 1      |      |
| I – Associated Design Group, Inc. (Baton Rouge) |                   |          |          | 2      |        |      |

**Firm A – 13    Firm E – 6    Firm D – 8    Firm G – 7    Firm I - 2**

Final Ballot between Firm A – John J. Guth Associates, Inc. and Firm D – Aillet, Fenner, Jolly & McClelland, Inc.

| Project # 1 Firm                             | Final Ballot |          |          |        |        |      |
|--|--------------|----------|----------|--------|--------|------|
|  | Moses        | Mustapha | Ferguson | Hoover | Kramer | User |
| A – John J. Guth Associates, Inc.            | X            |          | X        |        | X      | X    |
| D – Aillet, Fenner, Jolly & McClelland, Inc. |              | X        |          | X      |        |      |

**Firm A – 4    Firm D – 2**

The Firm of John J. Guth Associates, Inc. was selected by written majority vote.

**ITEM #2: Cooling Tower Replacement Southwest Louisiana War Veterans Home, Jennings, Louisiana; Project No. 03-134-18-01, F.03000023;** Mr. Harry Navarre gave a brief scope of the project; votes were recorded as follows:

| Project # 2 Firm                              | Nomination Ballot |          |          |        |        |      |
|---|-------------------|----------|----------|--------|--------|------|
|   | Moses             | Mustapha | Ferguson | Hoover | Kramer | User |
| E – Associated Design Group, Inc. (Lafayette) | 2                 | 3        | 1        | 3      |        | 3    |
| F – Poche Prouet Associates                   | 3                 |          | 3        |        | 3      | 2    |
| B – M & E Consulting, Inc.                    | 1                 | 2        |          | 1      | 1      | 1    |
| C – Ritter Consulting Engineers, Ltd.         |                   | 1        | 2        | 2      | 2      |      |

**Firm E – 12 Firm F – 11 Firm B – 6 Firm C - 7**

Final Ballot between Firm E – Associated Design Group, Inc. (Lafayette) and Firm F – Poche Prouet Associates

| Project # 2 Firm                              | Final Ballot |          |          |        |        |      |
|---|--------------|----------|----------|--------|--------|------|
|   | Moses        | Mustapha | Ferguson | Hoover | Kramer | User |
| E – Associated Design Group, Inc. (Lafayette) |              | X        |          | X      |        | X    |
| F – Poche Prouet Associates                   | X            |          | X        |        | X      |      |

**Firm E – 3 Firm F – 3**

1<sup>st</sup> Tiebreaker Final Ballot between Firm E – Associated Design Group, Inc. (Lafayette) and Firm F – Poche Prouet Associates

| Project # 2 Firm                              | 1 <sup>st</sup> Tiebreaker Final Ballot |          |          |        |        |      |
|---|---|----------|----------|--------|--------|------|
|   | Moses                                   | Mustapha | Ferguson | Hoover | Kramer | User |
| E – Associated Design Group, Inc. (Lafayette) |   |          | X        | X      |        | X    |
| F – Poche Prouet Associates                   | X                                       | X        |          |        | X      |      |

**Firm E – 3 Firm F – 3**

2<sup>nd</sup> Tiebreaker Final Ballot between Firm E – Associated Design Group, Inc. (Lafayette) and Firm F – Poche Prouet Associates

| Project # 2 Firm                              | 2 <sup>nd</sup> Tiebreaker Final Ballot |          |          |        |        |      |
|---|---|----------|----------|--------|--------|------|
|   | Moses                                   | Mustapha | Ferguson | Hoover | Kramer | User |
| E – Associated Design Group, Inc. (Lafayette) |   |          | X        | X      | X      | X    |
| F – Poche Prouet Associates                   | X                                       | X        |          |        |        |      |

**Firm E – 4 Firm F – 2**

The Firm of Associated Design Group, Inc. (Lafayette) was selected by unanimous majority vote.

Mr. Hoover reminded the board of the Selection Board’s original purpose, to distribute work among all engineering firms.

There being no further business, Mr. Hoover made a motion to adjourn the meeting. It was seconded by Mr. Ferguson. There being no opposition, the meeting was adjourned at 12:00 p.m.